

**Cabinet Member for Transport,
Planning and Sustainability**

27 September 2012

Report of the Director of City and Environmental Services

**A59 Phase 2 and Phase 3 Bus Priorities - Highway Proposals
Consultation**

A59 Phase 1 and 3 TRO Consultation

Reasons for Urgent Consideration

1. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning and Sustainability is requested to consider the designs and approve the proposals for immediate construction of the bus priority works. Urgency is required to integrate the roads surfacing elements to fit into the wider programme of road re-surfacing in the City and to ensure that the road surfacing activities are carried out before the temperature drops significantly and before the Christmas moratorium on highway works.

Executive Summary

2. City of York council has been successful in securing funding for the Access York scheme to expand Park & Ride capacity. To support the operation of the new Poppleton Bar site bus priority measures will be implemented at three locations along the A59 corridor.
3. This report provides details of the consultation carried out for the highway works forming Phase 2 and 3 of the A59 bus corridor scheme as shown in the plan attached as Annex 1.
4. This report updates the Cabinet Member on the changes made to address issues identified during the consultation period. The report recommends that amended designs should be approved for construction.
5. The Traffic Regulation Orders needed for the lengths of bus lane in Phase 1 and bus lane and parking restriction amendments needed for Phase 3 have been advertised; objections considered and reported.

Recommendations

6. The Cabinet Member is recommended to:
 - Note the comments raised by the public, Councillors and interested organisations.
 - Note the Officer's response to the comments and any proposed amendments to the design.
 - Approve the implementation of the scheme in line with the recommended improvements:
 - Phase 2 as set out in the drawing Annex 4
 - Phase 3 as set out in the drawing Annex 5
 - Approve the addition of the proposed Traffic Regulation Orders to the city-wide order.

Reason: To inform the Cabinet Member of the consultation responses and to enable the works to proceed prior to inclement weather and the moratorium on highway works.

Highway Works Consultation Details

7. The consultation gave local residents, stakeholders and other key group's opportunity to make their views known. Leaflets including a covering letter and proposal drawings (appended as Annex 2 and 3) were sent out to local residents as follows:
 - Phase 2 consultation: 24 August 2012 to 14 September 2012
 - Phase 3 consultation: 16 August 2012 to 7 September 2012
8. The consultation also included the following elements:
 - Consultation with council departments
 - Consultation with interest groups and emergency services
 - Employee Drop In Session at Holgate Park Drive
 - Meeting Benenden Healthcare Society and CPPGroup Plc
 - Consultation materials uploaded onto the council website

A59 Phase 2 - Consultation Responses

9. Three areas of concern were identified in the five comments returned from members of the public. These are listed in Table 1 and summarised in the subsequent paragraphs.

Table 1 - Summary of Main Comments Received (A59 Phase 2)

Response	Frequency
Concern about drainage problems in Carr Lane area	2
Do not want to have the parking lay-by near Manor Drive North removed	2
More cycle improvements required	1

A59 Phase 2 - Analysis of Consultation Comments

Concern about drainage problems in the Carr Lane Area

10. Respondents commented on the existing carriageway drainage problems experienced on the A59 in the Carr Lane area.

Officer Response

11. The Phase 2 proposals will not result in any increase in paved area, therefore will not place any further pressure on surface water drainage in the area. Also, no significant civil engineering works are planned in this phase so improvements to drainage in this area are not feasible.
12. Notwithstanding this council officers are aware of the existing issues. As part of our Phase 1 proposals an improved surface water drainage system will be constructed including greater attenuation of storm run off which will result in less upstream pressure on the Carr Lane area drains.

Concern about Parking Lay-by on the A59 near Manor Drive North

13. This issue will be covered in the Member Views section.

Cycle Improvements Insufficient

14. One resident felt that that cycle improvements were insufficient.

Officer Response

15. The scheme as designed represents the most optimal set of improvements that can be brought forward for all users as part of a bus priority proposal.

A59 Phase 2: Consultation with Stakeholders

North Yorkshire Police

16. North Yorkshire Police raised concern over the use of cycle symbol markings only.

Officer Response

17. The use of cycle symbols to diagram 1057 of the DfT's Traffic Signs Manual without the usually associated lining was agreed with the council cycling and walking officer as appropriate in this case to continue an on highway cycle lane over a short length of road where there is no potential to widen to achieve the required width for a formal lane due to the presence of utility equipment. This is in line with the City of York Council Standards & Principles for Designing Cycling Infrastructure which is agreed for adoption and use by the full council.

North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue

18. North Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Service were consulted. The Acomb fire station is within the scheme proposals. Acomb station has two pumps; one manned by a full time crew the other by a crew of local retained fire fighters. The fire service had the following concerns:

- Impact of congestion on response times
- Retained fire fighters use of Phase 1 bus lane when responding to the station
- Road markings outside the fire station and
- Potential for warning signs/lights or a 'Green Wave' traffic signals system

Officer Response

19. At a meeting with the fire service on 12 September 2012 the comments were addressed. It was agreed that the scheme proposals would improve congestion in the local area. It was also agreed that the issue of retained fire fighters responding to the station would be discussed with North Yorkshire Police.
20. Additional keep clear markings will be added to the fire station exit road. The provision of 'Wig-Wag' warning lights would be explored as part of detailed design of the traffic signals works. It may also be possible to retain and reuse the existing 'green-wave' equipment from

the Clifford Street station. This will be taken forward by the fire service.

Cycle Touring Club York

21. York Cycle Touring Club made the following requests:

- Can pedestrian crossing points be removed to improve off-road cycle route?
- Can the off-road cycle only path down Water End be changed to prevent frequent (errant) use by pedestrians
- Can the same path be made accessible to cyclists coming from Lindsey Ave or Poppleton Rd, for example through installing dropped kerb access points?

Officer Response

22. Dealing with each point in turn:

- Removing pedestrian crossing points that particularly benefit pedestrians and pedestrians with mobility problems to provide cycling facilities would not be in line with the council transport planning policy with respect to the hierarchy of road users.
- The existing off-road cycle only path down Water End is already marked and signed for cyclists only. Adding extra signs or markings would be a waste of money and cause sign clutter without necessarily improving compliance.
- The cycle path is segregated from the carriageway at this point by a low wooden fence and a low grass bank. A dropped kerb, new surfacing connection and amendments to the fence and bank would be needed. A more cost effective solution designed as part of these proposals is to provide a short length of on street cycle lane along Water End. This is accessible to cyclists coming from Lindsey Ave or Poppleton Rd via the junction and links to the existing cycle lane facility on Water End bridge.

A59 Phase 2: Member Views

Ward Councillors

23. Councillor Simpson-Laing made the following comment:

- Examine potential to remove the parking lay by on the outbound side of the A59 for safety reasons stemming from poor visibility for drivers waiting to turn out of Manor Drive North.

Officer Response

24. Council officers consulted with the two neighbouring local businesses. Both business owners do not object to the relocation of the parking lay by within the general area but are opposed to its total removal. It is believed that construction of the lay by was funded by the previous business owner to smooth traffic flow for users accessing the shops.
25. The existing parking lay by is well used throughout the day. The council Network Management team support its retention in that it forms a useful facility for passing trade. If it is removed vehicles may park in the main A59 carriageway causing delay and safety issues or potentially cause congestion on Manor Drive North.
26. The proposed amendment is to relocate the lay by closer to the back of footway and formalise the lay by exit point. This creates a safer more conventional lay by and brings about an increased visibility distance for traffic turning out of the minor road. The safe capacity of the lay by will be reduced from three to two vehicles.

Party Group Leaders

27. Councillor D'Agorne of the Green Party commented that he felt that all on road cycle lanes should be 1.5m wide, or minimum 1.3m where they are ASL feeder lanes. If this is not feasible consideration should be given to removing the substandard width lanes in favour of wider nearside lanes and shared use paths with slips onto and off the carriageway either side of the side roads.

Officer Response

28. As detailed in paragraph 17 the use of cycle symbols only to continue an on-road cycle lane over a short length of road is appropriate, has been agreed with the council cycling and walking officer and is in line with council cycle design standards.

A59 Phase 3 - Consultation Responses

29. Nine main areas of concern were identified in responses from members of the public. These are listed in Table 2 and summarised in the subsequent paragraphs.

Table 2 - Summary of Main Comments Received (A59 Phase 3)

Response	Frequency
Tisbury Road issues	22
Commuters parking on residential street	17
Windmill Rise realignment - loss of "roundabout"	10
Windmill Rise realignment - difficulty turning right	10
Time saving doesn't justify scheme	8
Tree concerns	6
Proposals introduce too many signals in a short length	5
Outbound Bus stop - problems exiting St Swithin's Walk	5
Consultation issues	4

A59 Phase 3 - Analysis of Consultation Comments

Tisbury Road Issues

30. The residents of Tisbury Road submitted a group response requesting that the right turn into Tisbury Road not be made more difficult and requested improvements to the no through road traffic signage.

Officer Response

31. Further improvements have been added to the scheme proposal to address these concerns.
- Alteration to the pedestrian refuge to make the right turn manoeuvre easier.
 - Provision of right turn markings within the junction to highlight the movement and provide a turning bay.
 - Provision of new no through road signs at the junction of Tisbury Road and Poppleton Road.

Commuters Parking on Residential Streets

32. Local residents have raised concern about the migration of commuter parking into residential streets as a result of the bus lane on the A59.

Officer Response

33. Council officers have met with the key employers on Holgate Park Drive to discuss the impact of the scheme. A number of mitigation measures will be brought forward to address this issue.

34. The council has committed to work with the employers to produce travel plans for each business. The travel plan will collect information on employee travel patterns and bring forward initiatives and interventions to maximise sustainable travel. By bringing forward sustainable alternatives less pressure will be put on the stock of on road parking spaces in the local area.
35. After the scheme has been constructed the Park & Ride buses will serve the stops on the A59 at Holgate Park Drive area as the only interim stop, providing a high quality public transport alternative. The service buses travelling along the corridor will be able to use the new bus priority measures and will be boosted by the new 14 service from Acomb – York Sports Village which starts in October 2012. This will result in a quarter hourly frequency of service along the A59 until the Poppleton Bar Park and Ride site opens.
36. In the interim period the council will continue to monitor parking issues in the local area and intervene if the situation deteriorates substantially.

Windmill Rise Realignment - Loss of "Roundabout"

37. Many local residents from the Windmill Rise area objected to the realignment of Windmill Rise junction with Poppleton Road (A59). This would result in the removal of the central circular splitter island known colloquially as 'the roundabout'. Many residents felt that it adds character, has historical value and links to the windmill (including a small sapling planted on it).

Officer Response

38. The re-alignment of Windmill Rise junction would simplify the turning movements at the junction; however, it is not a key part of the project. Therefore, the realignment will be removed and the current layout maintained. The performance of the junction after the scheme has been implemented will be monitored.

Windmill Rise Realignment – Difficulty turning Right

39. Respondents highlighted a perceived difficulty in turning right out of Windmill Rise, due to the relative proximity of the downstream (bus gate) traffic signals on Poppleton Road.

Officer Response

40. The original layout included for sufficient space to turn right safely out of Windmill Rise, however, the layout has been amended to further

increase the separation between Windmill Rise and the bus gate, increasing storage capacity and visibility on approach to the bus gate.

Time Saving Doesn't Justify Scheme

41. Respondents questioned whether the journey time savings achievable justified the scheme proposals.

Officer Response

42. Successful Park & Ride schemes depend upon a fast, reliable and high quality bus service. Traffic modelling carried out for this project forecast bus journey time savings of around 5 minutes at peak times. This saving equates to a 20% improvement over journey times without the proposals.
43. The works as proposed represent the most cost effective and efficient way of prioritising public transport without introducing long delays for other road users. The council has satisfied the Department for Transport that the Access York project represents value for money for the UK taxpayer. The scheme results in substantial transport and environmental benefits far outweighing the scheme cost.

Tree Concerns

44. Four comments were received highlighting concern over impact on trees in the local area. Concern was primarily over potential impact on the large mature specimens on the south side of Poppleton Road.

Officer Response

45. The scheme has been designed to minimise impact on trees in the local area. The trees to the south side of Poppleton Road will not be affected by the scheme. It is possible that a small number of trees to the north side of Poppleton Road may suffer root damage or need to be removed to facilitate the key (unavoidable) elements of the proposals.
46. If this is the case then the council will replant similar trees of native species in the immediate area following advice from the council's arboreal officer. Planting will exceed any removals to give a net increase in the tree stock in the local area.

Proposals Introduce too many Signals in a Short Length

47. Some respondents felt that the proposals would lead to too many traffic signals in a short length.

Officer Response

48. The traffic signals along this section of road will be linked and co-ordinated through the Council's Urban Traffic Control (UTC) system. Traffic conditions will be remotely monitored through CCTV with the potential for override should the situation demand it. This represents a significant improvement on the management of signals in the corridor as currently all traffic signal junctions in the area are isolated and work independently.

Outbound Bus Stop - Problems exiting St Swithin's Walk

49. Respondents have made comment on the re-location of the outbound bus stop on Poppleton Road and potential impact on turning out of St Swithin's Walk.

Officer Response

50. Relocation and upgrade of the existing outbound bus stop is an essential part of the scheme to enable a new pedestrian crossing of the A59 to be created to serve the local area and to provide access to the bus stops. The proposed location of the bus stop has also been sited to minimise impact on a large mature chestnut tree.
51. Visibility from St Swithin's Walk along the A59 may be reduced when a bus is at the stop; this will occur once approximately every 10-15 minutes. Stops in locations such as this are not unusual throughout towns and cities in the UK and function safely if drivers obey the Highway Code.

Consultation Issues

52. Respondents have commented that the consultation was not extensive enough or did not give sufficient time for response.

Officer Response

53. The consultation gave local residents, stakeholders and other key group's opportunity to make their views known on the proposed highway works whilst ensuring value for money and adherence to the project timetable. The consultation extent was agreed with the Cabinet Member for Transport. A problem did occur with the leaflet drop on Windmill Rise. This was rectified by Officer's hand delivering letters and extending the deadline for response for those affected.

A59 Phase 3: Consultation with Stakeholders

North Yorkshire Police

54. North Yorkshire Police raised the following concerns:

- The proximity of the proposed signal controlled crossing to the bus gateway.
- Concern over the use of anti-pedestrian paving between the bus stop and the proposed crossing.
- New splitter island on Poppleton Road may affect on-road pedal cyclists.
- Left turn except buses marking has not been used correctly.
- Issues turning out of Windmill Rise.
- Holgate Road/Acomb Road traffic signals no obvious route for cyclists once they have reached the south side of the junction (outside house numbers 1 & 3).

Officer Response

55. Dealing with each point in turn:

- All traffic signals will be linked together and co-ordinated.
- Anti-pedestrian paving between the bus stop and the proposed crossing has been specified for safety reasons along the carriageway edge to prevent people walking in a very narrow margin area. Providing a footway directly along the carriageway edge between the bus stop and crossing is not feasible as it would mean the removal of a very large and important chestnut tree and the rebuilding of a significant length of retaining wall. A safe walking route has been provided to the rear of the verge area to link the bus stop and crossing.
- A splitter island on Poppleton Road is needed to mount traffic signals on but has been located and designed to minimise impact on-road pedal cyclists.
- The Left turn except buses marking will be revised and used correctly.
- Issues turning out of Windmill Rise – scheme has been redesigned see paragraph 41.
- Holgate Road/Acomb Road traffic signals no obvious route for cyclists on the south side of the junction – cyclists must either use the off road cycle path to the north of the road or ride in traffic as

there is insufficient space without affecting utility equipment or losing parking bays to create an outbound on road cycle lane at this location.

North Yorkshire County Council

56. North Yorkshire County Council wrote in support of the scheme.

York Cycle Campaign

57. Adrian Setter of the Campaign wrote to say that they do not support the use of bus lanes by motorcyclists.

A59 Phase 3: Member Views

Party Group Leaders

58. Councillor D'Agorne of the Green Party commented that introducing a larger staggered pedestrian crossing refuge island across the mouth of Holgate Park Drive might cause problems for cyclists.

Officer Response

59. The staggered crossing proposals and amendment of the pedestrian refuge island on Holgate Park Drive have been withdrawn.

60. Additionally a dropped kerb access will be installed to the south of Holgate Park Drive to enable inbound cyclists who are cycling on road to 'drop on' to the off road cycle path to the north side of Poppleton Road.

A59 Phase 1 and Phase 3 Traffic Regulation Orders

61. The Traffic Regulation Orders needed for the lengths of bus lane in Phase 1 and bus lane and parking restriction amendments needed for Phase 3 have been advertised; conclusions have been made and are reported as follows.

Phase 1

62. No objections were received.

Officer Response

63. None needed.

Phase 3

64. No objections were received in response to the advertisements placed in the press or placed in the locality. Five responses to the consultation exercise mentioned the TRO reference number and provided general comment on the scheme, but did not object to the Traffic Regulation Order itself.
65. These are listed in Table 3.

Table 3 – Respondents using the TRO Reference Number Main Comments Received (A59 Phase 3)

Response	Frequency
Extent of consultation	4
Commuters parking on residential street	3
Time saving doesn't justify scheme	3
Windmill rise realignment - difficulty turning right	2
Proposals introduces too many signals in a short length	2
Outbound Bus stop - problems with exiting St Swithin's Walk	2
Tree concerns	1

Officer Response

66. It can be seen from Table 3 that most comments received are generic scheme wide comments and as such are considered in previous paragraphs. Perhaps the most relevant objection area is that of commuter parking on residential streets which respondents believe may occur as a result of the removal of on street parking on the A59 proposed as part of the scheme and the associated TRO.
67. This issue is being mitigated initially through travel planning works which will be carried out with and by local employers. Any latent parking issues will be monitored.
68. We have fully considered all objections received and proposed mitigating amendments to the scheme where necessary. However we do not consider there to be any valid reason to modify the TRO proposals and jeopardise successful compliant use of the bus lanes.

Summary

69. The council has fully considered the major points of concern being cognisant of current Government and Council policy and has evaluated the situation considering potential impacts.

70. Where concerns were justified the scheme design has been revised to incorporate the following improvements:

Phase 2

- Parking lay by relocated slightly and layout amended to improve safety and visibility out of Manor Drive North;
- Additional “Keep Clear” road markings to be added to cover the Acomb Fire Station exit road. Provision of Wig–Wag lights to be investigated.

Phase 3

- Junction of A59 Poppleton Road/Tisbury Road/Holgate Park Drive, additional road markings and signage. Pedestrian crossing changes proposed for Holgate Park Drive have been withdrawn.
 - Windmill Rise junction to remain as is – retention of ‘roundabout’
 - Bus gate moved further downstream of Windmill Rise junction
71. These changes are shown in the proposed scheme drawings appended as Annex 4 and 5.
72. The council is committed to working with employers on Holgate Park Drive. Employer travel plans are being taken forward as a separate work stream.

Options

73. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning and Sustainability has the following options:
1. Approve the original consultation scheme layout drawing
 2. Approve a revised scheme layout drawing as indicated in Annexes 4 and 5
 3. Reject the scheme design

Analysis

74. If the Cabinet Member chooses Option 1 then the decision may result in a less compliant scheme being taken forward, that does not address residents’ concerns or technical design development. This choice may be subject to further scrutiny.

75. If the Cabinet Member chooses Option 2 (**RECOMMENDED**) this will enable the scheme design to be developed and construction take place in this financial year.
76. Choosing Option 3 would require the extensive re-modelling of the bus priority scheme in compliance with DfT requirements, potentially reducing the journey time savings for Park & Ride and potentially undermining the Poppleton Bar Park & Ride site and the entire Access York Phase 1: Park & Ride project. It would also introduce additional cost requirements and may mean that large values of work done to date would have been abortive. There are no opportunities to put bus priority measures anywhere else along the A59 other than in the proposed locations.

Estimated Costs

77. The scheme is estimated to cost around £600,000 which will be met from the overall Access York project budget.

Programme

78. Construction of Phases 1 and 2 of the works is proposed to commence as soon as approval is given. Phase 3 works will follow on and are currently planned for January 2013.

Council Plan

79. The highway works proposed as part of the Access York Park & Ride project will contribute to the following priorities of The Council Plan:
80. Create jobs and grow the economy – Construction of the highway works represents a substantial package of work for the CES Highways unit. Construction will benefit the local construction industry and construction material suppliers.
81. Get York moving – The public transport improvements will provide a boost to the priority reducing delays for existing bus users and benefiting new Park & Ride users when the site opens.
82. Protect the environment - Encouraging modal shift onto Park & Ride buses will provide environmental benefits in terms of reduced carbon emissions and better air quality in the city centre.

Implications

83. The following implications have been considered:

- **Financial** – Funding for the project has been approved by the Council and will be funded from the Access York Park & Ride project allocation.
- **Human Resources (HR)** – There are no Human Resource implications
- **Equalities** – The highway works have been designed to meet accessibility requirements, and will be designed to current design standards within very tight layout constraints.
- **Legal** – There are no legal implications
- **Crime and Disorder** – There are no Crime and Disorder implications
- **Information Technology (IT)** – There are no IT implications
- **Property** – There are no Property Implications
- **Other** – There are no other implications

Risk Management

84. A risk register for the delivery of the project has been prepared and mitigation measures applied where necessary. In compliance with the Council's risk management strategy measured in terms of impact and likelihood, the risk score has been assessed at less than 16. This means that at this point the risks need only to be monitored as they do not provide a real threat to the achievement of the objectives of this report.

Contact Details

Author:	Chief Officer Responsible for the report:		
Matt Rudman Access York Assistant Project Manager City and Environmental Services Tel No. 55 1624	NEIL TAYLOR Interim Director, City and Environmental Services		
	Report Approved	√	Date 24 Sept 2012
Specialist Implications Officer(s) <i>List information for all</i>			
Wards Affected: <i>Acomb</i>		All	
For further information please contact the author of the report			

Background Papers:

None

Annexes

Annex 1: Project Area and Context

Annex 2: Consultation Leaflet – Phase 2

Annex 3: Consultation Leaflet – Phase 3

Annex 4: Phase 2: Proposed Post Consultation Scheme Layout Drawing

Annex 5: Phase 3: Proposed Post Consultation Scheme Layout Drawing